KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER: INDIGENOUS AFRICAN MUSIC IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN MUSIC CURRICULUM

by

MANDY CARVER

Abstract: The need for redress in South African education includes calls for the decolonisation of the curriculum. In music education, this could imply a straight forward swap of content, replacing the 'hegemonic' Western classical canon with orally transmitted musical traditions in Africa. However, the picture clouds somewhat when the epistemological framework of the discipline of (Western) music is retained for the 'decolonised' curriculum, as this results in a disjuncture between the practice of African music and the way it is understood on a conceptual level in the curriculum. Drawing on the theories of Basil Bernstein and Karl Maton, this article probes the nature of the knowledge articulated in the South African secondary school, the basis of its specialisation, and its potential to equip students with knowledge that allows boundary crossing.

Keywords: Bernstein, Maton, music curriculum, knowledge, recontextualisation, decolonisation, semantic gravity, semantic waves.

Introduction

In post-apartheid South Africa, the need to overhaul a grotesquely unequal education system, and to establish a system of national education that is in line with the democratic ideals of the new South African Constitution, has made educational reform a priority.[1] However, the university student protests of 2015 and 2016 demanding a free, decolonised education, indicate that little meaningful change has taken place, and that equality in education is a remote goal. While the student calls for decolonisation demanded immediate change, the process of meaningful curriculum change cannot be achieved with a quick fix solution; by, for example, simply substituting 'Western' with 'African' content.[2]

---

[2]　In an essay such as this, the term 'African music' needs qualification. The article is written from a position that acknowledges that there is no one 'African music', but multiple practices that vary according to factors such as geography, continuity and the passage of time. While the use of the plural 'African musics', or 'musical practices' is less essentialist, it can result in a more laboured text. The choice made by the CAPS writers to use the term 'Indigenous African Music' adds no clarity, but rather obscures the question of what this music might consist. While scholars might resist a concise definition of what constitutes 'African musical knowledge', or indeed, what might be 'indigenous', curricula must articulate the knowledge or learning that is to be covered. This essay considers the CAPS' interpretation of 'Indigenous African' musical knowledge.

This article examines the curriculum content choices for the Indigenous African Music (hereafter IAM) stream of the South African Curriculum and Assessment Policy for Music (hereafter CAPS), published by the Department of Education in 2011.[3] An overarching aim for all subjects of the Curriculum is for indigenous knowledge systems to be valued, and although this has resulted in a small percentage of content being drawn from indigenous sources in most subject areas, little systematic research identifies the organising principles of this knowledge and appropriate ways for it to be transferred into formal learning contexts that pay attention to both experiential and conceptual knowledge. A rich tradition of music making in South Africa represents a significant repertoire of musical material that might contribute to a curriculum. The music curriculum includes a degree of what it refers to as 'Indigenous African' content, but this content is framed by Western conceptualisations of musical understanding, so while curricular content might be changed, the epistemology is not changed.

This article problematises this curricular design, and argues that the disjuncture between African musical practice and Western musical theory prevents the possibility of cumulative knowledge building (Maton 2014). It argues that in order for IAM to be established in South African education, it must be shown to constitute specialist knowledge that is commensurate with the knowledge of the parallel curricular streams of Western Art Music (WAM) and Jazz. Further, it considers whether the indigenous African musical knowledge, as articulated in the South African Curriculum, shows specialisation on its own terms, or by being correlated with, and subsumed into Western musical knowledge. This analysis utilises Bernstein's articulation of knowledge discourses and knowledge structure and Maton's extension of these, in particular, his description of Semantics.[4]

The article begins with an account of the clash between African practice and Western theory of music as identified in the music curricula of various African countries. Then a description of the South African CAPS highlights the nature of this same mismatch and how it contributes to the undermining of IAM as specialist knowledge. The second half of the article draws on the theoretical work of Bernstein and Maton to explore the challenge of transferring musical knowledge that has been taught and learned in a community through oral means to a formal curriculum, and the importance of integration between empirical and abstract knowledge in learning.

Formal music curricula in African countries
In Africa, as previously colonised countries gained their independence, it took some

---

3   The South African National Curriculum is divided into the following bands: The General Education and Training (GET) Band comprises the Foundation Phase (Grades R–3), the Intermediate Phase (Grades 4-6) and the Senior Phase (Grades 7–9). The Further Education and Training (FET) Band covers Grades 10–12. The data for this research is drawn from this final Band. The Curriculum can be downloaded from www.thutong.doe.gov.za/ResourceDownload. aspx?id=44641.

4   I follow Maton's convention by capitalizing the LCT term, 'Semantics'.

time for the colonial model that provided the historic starting point for formal, school-based education, to be queried. African musical material made a late entry into curricula that continue to rely on the epistemology of the Western classical model, based on a trio of performance, history of music and analysis, and composition. In Western classical music, all three require a high level of literacy in staff notation, an emphasis that is retained in the African music curricula. These curricula replace the performance of Western music with African music, but the prescribed, theoretical knowledge remains Western. Students might gain practical knowledge from African musical practices, but the concepts and tools that afford analysis, interpretation and discussion of this musical content do not correspond closely with these musical practices. Instead, concepts and tools pertain to the aesthetics of WAM. Literature from Nigeria, Zambia, Malawi and Tanzania reveals that the problem of a disjuncture between theoretical and practical knowledge in music curricula is widespread throughout the continent (Irivwieri 2009, Ligoya 2013, Mapana 2013, Mumpuka 2009).

The steadily growing scholarship on African music education addresses the problem of the dominance of Western over indigenous music, and emphasises the importance of cultural values in conceptual understanding (Akuno 2005, Chanhunka 2005, Kwami 1998, Kwami, et al 2003, Musakula 2014).[5] Common topics are ethnographic content that might be included in classrooms (Herbst et al 2003, Herbst 2005, Mans 1997, Oehrle 2013), the challenges of teacher education and teacher competence (Bantwini 2010, Chadwick 2012, Delport and Mufute 2010), and the role of music in transmitting values (Addo et al 2003, Akuno 2005, Chanhunka 2005, Ntsihlele 1982). Nzewi's work is highly influential in the field and his ideological corpus is informed by the African Renaissance.[6] Nzewi's writing consistently draws on recurring themes such as how the musical arts in African society induce humane, moral behaviour (2003: 1, 2009: 175), are a force for healing (2003: 15, 2009: 81) and, that there is conformity among sub-Saharan cultural values (2003: 14, 2005: vii, Nzewi and Omolo-Ongati 2014: 56). The ideological perspective of the importance of music in African cultures, and the drive to identify examples of African musical practices are not irrelevant in the task to introduce African musical knowledge to the formal curriculum. However, this research has not yet had an impact on curricula on a deeper level other than the substitution of African performative content for Western content. This situation perpetuates a curricular structure that separates practical and theoretical knowledge, and importantly, does not interrogate how the African content is to be framed conceptually. The 'indigenous' knowledge is confined to performance and propositional knowledge and the conceptual

---

[5]   This literature uses the term 'musical arts of Africa' in preference to 'African music' in order to emphasise the multi-arts phenomenon of musicking in Africa, which can include dance, costume, poetry, mask and drama. The use of this term can be traced to The Pan African Society for Musical Arts Education (PASMAE) conference which was held in Lusaka in 2001.

[6]   Originally coined by Chiekh Anta Diop (1996), the idea of the African Renaissance was adopted by South African President Thabo Mbeki. Mbeki's articulation of an African Renaissance includes not merely shedding the legacy of colonialism, but embracing Africa's past and future contribution to perceptions of civilisation.

content is drawn from Western music theory. While the literature on African music education addresses many topical issues, it does not provide a systematic approach to curriculum, pedagogy and assessment that integrates conceptual knowledge with practical knowledge and that demonstrates progression. Indeed, this model is evident in the South African Music Curriculum to which I now turn.

The South African Curriculum (CAPS), Grades 10-12
The South African Curriculum takes the form of individual documents covering a range of subjects for the different educational levels over 12 years of schooling. The data that inform this paper are drawn from a wider study that critically analyses the South African Curriculum and Assessment Policy (CAPS) for Music, for Grade 10–12 (Department of Education 2011).[7] The study comprises a detailed, textual analysis of the curriculum's prescribed content and its internal coherence across content, pedagogical implications and assessment.

   The curriculum content is organised under three topics, 'Music Performance and Improvisation', 'Music Literacy', and 'General Music Knowledge and Analysis'. These topics correlate with the strands of established music curricula, namely practical performance, theory of music (arranging and composition), and music analysis.

Streaming
A key feature of the music curriculum is that it is streamed; schools can choose to teach one of three musical traditions: WAM, Jazz, or IAM.[8] Multiculturalism forms the philosophical background to this design as all three streams follow the same curricula structure comprising three topics, thereby suggesting that these three musics are equal, but different enough to warrant discrete study. The content of the three topics is not consistently individualised for the three streams as there is a significant proportion of shared content. For example, within the IAM stream, individualised content is provided for Topic 1 (Music Performance and Improvisation), and for Topic 3, (General Music Knowledge and Analysis) but the content for Topic 2 (Music Literacy) is common to all three streams. The shared content of Topic 2 comprises a conventional theory of music syllabus along the lines of those published by the music examination boards (ABRSM, Trinity College and UNISA), with only minor, additional content for Jazz and IAM.[9] Those small adjustments, importantly, are more relevant to Jazz than IAM.

---

[7]   Recent studies that consider the CAPS Music Curriculum include Drummond 2015, Hellberg 2014, McConnachie 2016.

[8]   Of these, WAM has the longest history within formal education. The inclusion of Jazz in formal curricula began in the 1950s and the consequent development of formal jazz pedagogy has not been without its controversies (Gatien 2009). The priorities of WAM pedagogy, with the centrality of a canon, and structured instrumental pedagogy have largely been transferred to jazz education.

[9]   UNISA (University of South Africa) music examinations as well as those provided by the British examination boards, the Associated Board of the Royal School of Music (ABRSM), and Trinity College are highly regarded in South Africa. This is evident in their graded exams providing the benchmark for the practical achievement standards of the South African Curriculum.

The general content of Topic 2 concerns the rudiments of music theory, starting with simple concepts and progressing toward more complex processes like harmony and arrangement. While the broad concepts of pitch, rhythm, harmony, texture, and so on, may be applied to music from diverse traditions, no substantive account of the particular theoretical concepts pertaining to African musics is provided in Topic 2. The concepts embedded in African musical practices, their theoretical underpinnings, and structural foundation are explained and understood by way of the theory of music drawn from WAM, which priorities tonal-functional harmony.

Thus, in the development of the IAM Curriculum, an established curricular structure has been retained, and although a new musical stream is established, the theory of music course contained in Topic 2 maintains its orientation toward WAM. The reasons for the use of a standard Western music theory course can only be surmised, as no explanation is provided by the curriculum. Since there are three musical streams offered by the curriculum, Western music theory could perhaps be seen as a common language that can be applied equally to all musical practices. This highlights one of the functions of music theory, namely, as a means toward music literacy, or skill in reading and writing music notation. Different musics however, prioritise different things and a course based on the rudiments of Western classical music will inevitably be in conflict on some level with the priorities of IAM. On the other hand, the use of Western music theory in the South African Curriculum could imply that IAM has no nuanced theory of its own. This presumption results in a disjuncture between African musical practice and Western musical theory that is not unique to the South African Curriculum but evident in school curricula elsewhere in Africa, as noted above.

CAPS programme of assessment
The programme of assessment for this Curriculum is in two parts. It includes prescribed, school-based assessment tasks, and end of year examinations that are assessed nationally at Grade 12. The Curriculum document itself provides detailed requirements for these, and in addition, guidelines have been published that further clarify the assessment criteria.[10] At an organisational level, the streamed structure of the CAPS is repeated in assessment, with a degree of individualised and shared content. Not all the assessment tasks are separated into the three different steams and a significant amount of IAM specific content laid out in the termly teaching plans has no corresponding assessment. A glaring omission is the lack of guidelines for the assessment of IAM's Topic 1, Music

---

[10]   A programme of assessment is presented in Section Four of the Curriculum document (Department of Education 2011: 52). This covers 'Practical Assessment Tasks (PATS), which are completed during the course of the school year, as well as an outline of the externally assessed practical and written examinations. Supporting this assessment schedule, the Department of Basic Education has, in addition, published two sets of assessment guidelines. 'Guidelines for Practical Assessment Tasks' (South African Department of Basic Education 2014a) concerns the assessment of the Grade 12 PATS, and 'Examination Guidelines' (South African Department of Basic Education 2014b) concerns the external assessment of the Grade 12 practical and written examinations.

Performance and Improvisation. Despite an individualised outline for content in the termly teaching plans, no IAM specific assessment guidelines have been made available to schools.[11]

The missing guidelines for the assessment of IAM Topic 1 stands in stark contrast to the high level of detail provided for the assessment of other sections of the Curriculum. For example, the guidelines for the assessment of Topic 2 are explicit and clarify what will be assessed, as well as how it will be assessed. Clear, detailed information for assessments such as this has an impact on a curriculum at the classroom level, as teachers are usually keen for their students to do well in national assessments.

Where explicit criteria exist for the IAM content, they are determined by principles that are oriented toward the WAM stream. Thus, the different ways that IAM is articulated and affirmed as specialist knowledge in the Curriculum content are, for the most part, undermined through the process of assessment.

Establishing oral practices as specialist knowledge in the curriculum

These contradictions illustrate the challenge of bringing a non-formal, oral practice into the formal context of the curriculum and school. The choice of a three-topic curricular design that conforms to the established format of music curricula is premised upon IAM's equality with WAM and Jazz. In Western music curricula, each one of these topic areas has a structural logic. In performance pedagogy, skills are learned incrementally, focused on canonical musical works that progress from simple to complex. A canon of works also informs the syllabi for stylistic knowledge, for both WAM and jazz. With regard to the music theory syllabi, the highly-structured pedagogy of Western music theory provides conceptual content that progresses from simple to complex. These constitute a kind of vertical trajectory for knowledge that contributes toward it being considered specialist and thus worthy of a place in a formal curriculum. IAM may not have an established canon of musical works that constitute an undisputed corpus on which to base a curriculum, but it must demonstrate its capacity for specialisation and progression. I suggest that the choice made by the curriculum writers to use Western music theory in the IAM curriculum is a way to maintain specialisation of content that correlates with the other streams. In other words, maintaining the Western music theory affords a level of specialisation, as well as equality, alongside the two other streams. This choice, however, both undermines the IAM content and leads to a disjointed curriculum.

A further means of establishing specialist knowledge in the IAM content is its use of special terminology. The use of language for the IAM content is one of the ways its distinction from WAM and Jazz is established. Although the language used in the IAM content evokes an impression of musical knowledge that can be distinguished from WAM and Jazz, its ability to communicate clear, unambiguous meanings is questionable.

---

[11] The curriculum document (Department of Education 2011, 11) states that achievement levels and assessment criteria for IAM performance are outlined in the Department of Basic Education Guidelines. No such document has ever been published (Khemese, pers. Comm. 2017)

Examples of terms exclusive to the IAM stream include some that have become familiar in the musical arts, or ethnomusicological literature, such as *melorhythm* (2011: 42). There are also terms such as *crepitations*, *Afrophonia* and *phoneaesthetics* (*ibid*.: 59, 63, 60) which have yet to acquire currency. The use of vague and confusing terminology has implications for the teachers who deliver the curriculum in classrooms around South Africa as it fails to convey clearly what should be taught (McConnachie 2016: 113).

CAPS summary

The streamed design of the music curriculum retains the established three-part formula of Western curricula for all three streams. Along with the shared content of Topic 2, this formula evokes a sense of equality between the streams. A sense of the specialist nature of the IAM stream is achieved by the use of Western music theory with its highly structured formulas that afford 'literacy' in the sense of reading and writing of music. Much of the IAM content of Topics 1 and 3, including the IAM specific terminology, receives no explicit mention in the assessment schedule which is dominated by WAM specific criteria. As a consequence of these factors, the IAM Curriculum is marred by a mismatch between the practice of IAM and the theoretical content that supports conceptual understanding, thus preventing the possibility for the integrated learning of practical and theoretical content.

Why is there this problem with mismatching? The underlying assumption of the curriculum document is that the content of each stream is equal. Along with this, there is also a tacit assumption that the musical knowledge in the different streams is equal. The complexity of balancing oral/aural musical knowledge with musical knowledge that has an established formal pedagogy based on a canon of works makes apparent the inherent unfairness of standardisation. Due to the requirement for the curriculum to be 'equal' in the way it presents the knowledge for the three different streams, it is unsurprising that there is a degree of shared content, and that this content (music theory) is drawn from Western music, simply because it has an established pedagogy based on writing. It is easy to be flippant about what is required, or indignant about an ongoing hegemony, but it is difficult to give equal value to such musics within a structure established on the basis of one particular epistemology. Clearly, the introduction of a previously informally pedagogised field into a formally pedagogised one is a challenge that needs careful consideration.

Bernstein and Maton in South African curriculum reform and in music education

To bring a theoretical lens to this discussion, I turn to Bernstein, in particular to his descriptions of knowledge structure. In addition, Maton sheds light on the relationship between empirical and conceptual knowledge and its impact on knowledge building. While much of the discourse on diversity in music education is based on a constructivist ontology that resists value judgements about the relative worth of different musical genres and their associated ways of knowing, Bernstein's theories strongly influenced the development of a social realist approach to knowledge. Maton's work is part of

this trajectory. While social constructivism posits the socially constructed nature of all knowledge, social realism acknowledges that while knowledge is socially situated, different forms of knowledge have the potential for varying degrees of explanatory power (Luckett and Hunmna 2014: 2).

Bernstein's theories have been widely applied to questions of education in South Africa and have made an important contribution in the recent progress of curricula reform (Bertram 2012, Bolton 2006, Hoadley 1997, 2005, 2011, Ensor 1997, Ensor and Galant 2005), but up to now neither Bernstein nor Maton has been applied to the study of African music curricula.[12] In the international field of music education, it is only recently that Bernstein's theories have started to be influential. Wright's research explores Bernstein's articulation of the underlying power structures in education and how these contribute to social justice, particularly in music education (Wright 2006, 2008, Philpott and Wright 2012, Wright and Davies 2010, Wright and Froehlich 2012). Much of the Bernsteinian research in music education ponders the questions arising from the introduction of popular music into curricula, and in particular the increasingly influential 'Musical Futures' model that is based on Green's research (Green 2001, 2008, McPhail 2013, Moore 2013, Sætre 2014).[13] This research probes the impact of an increased focus on praxis and the informal learning pedagogies of popular music that have gained more curricular space while reducing the emphasis on the more formal aspects, such as music theory and history.

Bernstein's concepts are extended by Karl Maton's formulation of Legitimation Code Theory (LCT). This framework includes a set of tools that allows for a nuanced interrogation of the organising principles of different knowledge fields. There is a growing body of South African scholarship using LCT concepts (Jackson 2015, Myers 2016, Schudel 2014, Siebörger and Adendorff 2015). Internationally, initial studies suggest the potential of LCT to address problems in the field of music education (Carroll 2017, Lamont and Maton 2010; Martin 2012).

In what follows, Bernstein and Maton's theories are used to probe the nature of indigenous musical knowledge and how it is articulated as curriculum. In particular, this analysis illustrates how these theories can speak to the problem of incorporating and legitimizing indigenous knowledge in formal curricula.

---

[12] The current Curriculum and Assessment Policy (CAPS) is the third iteration of the curriculum since Curriculum 2005 was published in 1997. This reform process has taken the following path: In 1997 constructivist outcomes-based education was introduced. It was followed in 2002 with the Revised National Curriculum Statement. This was subject to another revision in 2009. In 2011, the current Curriculum, the National Curriculum Statement for Grades R-12 was published, taking effect from January 2012. Following recommendations based on Bernsteinian theory, the radical constructivist principles of the previous versions of the curriculum were modified to result in a more content driven curriculum (Hoadley 2011). Music has been included in each version of the curriculum. The CAPS for Grade 10–12 presents a discrete Learning Area called 'Music'. For Grades 7–9, Music is included in 'Creative Arts' along with Dance, Drama and Art.

[13] Musical Futures is a project that put into practice Green's research on applying the principles of learning used by popular musicians in school classrooms (2008). See www.musicalfutures.org for more information.

Bernstein's horizontal and vertical discourse – common and uncommon knowledge

African musics, like popular music and other examples of world music, learned largely through oral/aural methods, do not have a body of established texts. This presents a challenge if they are to be included in a formal curriculum that is designed around canonical works. Bernstein's categorisation of knowledge discourses provides a starting point to explore the nature of knowledge and insight into the reasons for the mismatch evident in the IAM CAPS. He distinguishes two broad knowledge types: horizontal discourse (everyday knowledge) and vertical discourse, (formal knowledge). For Bernstein, horizontal discourse concerns everyday, or common knowledge, that is, the knowledge needed to perform tasks of everyday life (2000: 157). He says, learned through modelling, horizontal discourse

> is likely to be oral, local, context dependent and specific, tacit, multi-layered and contradictory across but not within contexts ... the crucial feature is that it is segmentally organised *(ibid.*: 159).

This segmental organisation means that horizontal discourse is concerned with the immediate context, and what is known in one context cannot be transferred or applied in a different context. Important for purposes of my analysis of CAPS, Bernstein notes that "horizontal discourse is directed towards acquiring a common competence rather than a graded performance" (*ibid.*).

The participatory aspect of African musicking is much celebrated, (Berliner 1978, Blacking 1976, Chernoff 1979, Dargie 1988, Nketia 1975, Small 1984). In general terms, there is seldom a separation between audience and performer, and it is the usual practice for all members of the community to share a common competence. Music is learned in a local context, most often without an accompanying vocabulary of explanatory terms (Agawu 2016: 148). This results in music that all members of the community can perform and it becomes a context which Bernstein would refer to as horizontal discourse. Of course, music making characterized by common competence does not by any means describe all African musical practice; there are many styles that require specialist training that exceeds the bounds of common competence. A generalization could be made that would separate songs, which are often communal, and instrumental styles which demand an increased level of skill from the performer. Some instruments have virtuosic traditions; notable examples are the *timbila* xylophone from Mozambique, Zimbabwe's *mbira dza vadzimu* or the West African *kora*. A distinction must therefore be made between music that everyone can perform, and more specialized music that requires special application. Such knowledge might be organised along a simple to complex continuum. For Bernstein, it is not simplicity or complexity that differentiates horizontal and vertical discourse, but the degree to which the discourse is systematically organized. This organization impacts on the curricular potential of knowledge. The question for African music in education is not so much whether it yields examples of everyday or specialized knowledge, but how the verticality (or specialist meanings) of African musical practices can be appropriately transferred into formal curricula, which are in the realm of vertical discourse.

Bernstein contrasts horizontal discourse, or common, everyday knowledge with vertical discourse. This vertical discourse concerns not the knowledge of the everyday, but 'uncommon' knowledge that is characterised by systematic ordering principles that provide structure for the knowledge. He suggests these ordering principles allow knowledge to be

> freed from the particular, the local, through the various languages of the sciences or forms of reflexiveness of the arts which make possible either the creation or discovery of new realities (1975: 99).

The essential quality that permits knowledge to be freed from its context lies in the potential it contains for abstraction. It is through abstraction and conceptualization that knowledge can be applied across contexts. As the vertical or horizontal binary is commonly seen as a mental or manual divide, and further, as applying to written as opposed to oral knowledge, African music's association with the realm of orality makes the task of unraveling knowledge types for application in formal education an important one if African music is to have an equal place alongside other musics in the curricula.

One more aspect of Bernstein's theory informs this discussion. To distinguish between the very broad span of fields that represent formal knowledge, or vertical discourse, Bernstein conceptualizes two types: fields are characterized as having either a hierarchical or a horizontal knowledge structure, reflecting the way that knowledge is developed in each. In hierarchical structure, concepts are built one upon the other and are integrated and incorporated into ever more general theories. New knowledge is dependent on, and extends previously established knowledge. In horizontal knowledge structure, new knowledge is introduced in the form of a new 'language' that does not depend on previous concepts but has its own logic.

This leads to an important question: if vertical discourse allows us to move beyond the present context and to discover new realities, what are the possibilities for both 'simple' and 'complex' knowledge to be systematically and explicitly restructured in a curriculum (whether the curriculum is prescribed or enacted) to afford the formulation of context-independent knowledge?

Verticality and grammaticality

Using Bernstein's descriptions of knowledge structures, Muller conceptualises 'verticality' as the potential for progression within a field (2007). For knowledge that is integrated into an encompassing theory (Bernstein's hierarchical structure), Muller suggests stronger 'verticality' in instances where new knowledge is introduced segmentally alongside old knowledge (Bernstein's horizontal structure). For Muller, 'grammaticality' refers to how closely the conceptual structure corresponds with its empirical correlates. When concepts are built up to comprise a vertical structure and are linked unambiguously with their referents in the real world, strong grammaticality is the result. This has relevance for knowledge and the curriculum because a characteristic of strong grammaticality is a more explicit curriculum in which the knowledge that is to be acquired is clearly delineated and visible. An example of this is the relatively

strong verticality of music theory in established Western music education. Concepts are built one upon the other in an integrative structure, and these concepts unambiguously reference their correlates as the inter-sonic structures of Western classical music. This close matching allows a more explicit articulation of curriculum, pedagogy and evaluation because the knowledge at both theoretical and empirical levels is overt (Shalem and Slonimsky 2010). If there is less verticality to the knowledge structure, a strong connection to the empirical is less possible, resulting in curriculum, pedagogy and evaluation being less explicit. In South Africa, since the curricular reform process resulted in a move away from constructivism, toward a more explicit, content driven curriculum, a knowledge structure with strong verticality, such as Western music theory, presented an appealing choice to the curriculum writers. Enlisting the strong verticality of Western music theory, without paying attention to its relationship with the grammar of IAM itself, has resulted in the CAPS document demonstrating little coherence and a slim chance of integrating practical experience with theoretical concepts.

Maton brings Bernstein and Muller's ideas together and further clarifies the description of knowledge structures. Building on Bernstein's theory of knowledge structures, he asserts that Bernstein's conceptualisation, while suggestive, is dichotomous and does not allow for the subtleties and variations within knowledge fields (Maton 2014: 47). Maton draws on Bernstein and Bourdieu to extend Bernstein's theory to allow for more fine-tuned analyses and interpretations. The complexity of knowledge fields and the need for subtle theorisation is well illustrated by the field of Music Studies. Bernstein would describe Music, a member of the Humanities, as having a horizontal knowledge structure. Musical styles from different places and epochs, for example, music from the Renaissance, Tuareg blues, jazz and punk rock represent different 'languages' and can all be taught without reference to each other. On the other hand, the theory of music could be described as hierarchical, as concepts are built one upon the other, toward an Archimedean point of tonal-functional harmony.

Maton's Semantics and cumulative knowledge building
Building on the central need for abstraction in vertical discourse, Maton formulates the concepts of semantic gravity and semantic density to bring more clarity to the organising principles of knowledge fields (Maton 2014). I focus on the first of these, semantic gravity.

Maton conceptualises semantic gravity as the quality that affords knowledge a greater or lesser degree of context independence. Knowledge can be context dependent and limited to the immediate context, or context independent and have the potential to apply in new settings (2014: 107). Importantly, the concept does not describe a binary principle, but encompasses the potential to become stronger or weaker depending on the degree of context-dependence or context-independence. Strong gravity implies meanings that are confined to their context, while weaker gravity implies meanings that can transfer across contexts. In Bernstein's terms, they are 'freed'. Maton's key point is that cumulative knowledge building, one of the central aims of education, is dependent

on the ability to master both strong and weak semantic gravity by grasping knowledge of different gravitational strengths and moving between them (*ibid*.: 121). This requires movement between more contextually confined meanings, and more contextually independent meanings. The potential for abstraction and conceptualisation lies at the centre of the concept of semantic gravity. To give an example from music, I might sing a game song in its context, but I might not do anything else with the song, having no insight into its embedded meanings, musical structures, historical context, or social meaning. Context-dependence restricts my knowledge to the singing of the song itself. To build cumulative knowledge, I need to go beyond the contextual performance to gain a grasp of the wider performative, structural and contextual meanings. Maton theorises the flow between stronger and weaker semantic gravity as the formation of semantic waves and asserts that making connections between the empirical and conceptual areas is the key to cumulative knowledge building.

What experience, what abstraction?

Music, as something profoundly experiential, embedded in social life, seems to sit uncomfortably in the cold world of analysis that typifies the vertical discourse of formal education. In his 1995 treatise, *Music Matters*, Elliot dismissed verbal terms as a means of organising a curriculum and emphasised instead that musicianship characterised by knowledge-in-action should form the basis of curricula. Musical experience is not devoid of conceptualisation, as Elliot argues:

> Music makers everywhere construct and chain musical patterns together, make same-different comparisons among musical sound patterns, and vary, transform, and abstract musical patterns (1995: 54-55).

Indeed, in musical experience (performance or listening), concepts need not be named to be intuited and understood; they can remain tacit.[14] For my purposes, Elliot's downplaying of verbal knowledge is interesting when seen in relation to another premise of *Music Matters*, that musicianship is always context-dependent. He claims that "knowledge cannot be separated from the context in which it is learned and used" (*ibid*.:72). This places musical knowledge in a precarious position because (the value of musical experience for personal growth notwithstanding) downplaying the wider meanings of musical knowledge staunches the opportunity for musical knowledge to take the learner beyond their horizon toward a critical understanding of music, indeed toward what Green describes as 'critical musicality' (Green 2008, Woodford 2005, 31).

I argue that Maton's conceptualisation of semantic gravity is pertinent to the conflict articulated by Elliot as verbal terms versus knowledge-in-action. The balance between the non-verbal, procedural, experiential knowledge of participatory performance, and the more abstract information concerning musical structure, styles, culture, identity,

---

[14] Jeanne Gamble's work on craft knowledge is suggestive as she describes the process of 'visualisation' in which apprentices build connections in their 'mind's eye'. This may have a direct correlation with musical learning, although in this case, a more appropriate term would be 'audiation' (2001: 197).

and so on, that depend on language, can be seen in terms of knowledge representing stronger semantic gravity (musical experience) and weaker semantic gravity (abstract or theoretical knowledge). If Maton is correct, then both have a role to play in education; it is not enough for a curriculum to focus only on musical practice, it must be supported by conceptual meanings that demand a level of abstraction. The crucial point is that the concrete and the abstract must be able to connect.

Although musicking is essentially a non-verbal process, in a formal curriculum articulating concepts through language is an important step towards building a principled knowledge structure that can inform further learning. Together these build specialist knowledge that can be applied beyond the immediate context and thus allow the learner to go beyond their horizon. The central role of conceptualisation extends to the field of African music, as underlined by Agawu in his assertion that

> without concepts, we cannot concretize insight. African music cannot be its own metalanguage, its own "interpreting" system; rather, language serves in the first instance as the interpreting system of music (2016: 148).[15]

Language in music education

Conceptualisation in curriculum and education contexts is facilitated largely through language. Even though music is a performance art, the key role of language in music studies is evident in the South African curriculum and its assessment schedule. Language is the means through which curricula are communicated, is the dominant method of teaching and learning in the classroom, and plays a central role in evaluation. Even in the realm of performance and practical instrumental learning, while sound and gesture are significant modes of communication, language often supports these.

Weekes demonstrates the crucial role that language and literacy have in music education (2014). She considers the Australian HSC Music 1 Curriculum which is aimed at the 'non-literate' musician and acknowledges the 'informal' acquisition of skills, mainly in the context of popular music.[16] Weekes' research demonstrates that, for students to be successful in the Australian HSC Music 1 examination, they require both a command of disciplinary language, as well as a systematic means of learning its terminology and associated concepts. The Australian curriculum, with its orientation toward the 'non-literate' musician, is philosophically progressive in its orientation toward praxis and student-led learning. Yet it retains an emphasis on concepts representing musical knowledge that are symbolised through language. Here, a student's command of language, and particularly their command of the disciplinary language that includes

---

[15]   Although somewhat dated, Swanwick and Tillman's spiral model for musical understanding has some value here (Swanwick and Tillman 1986; Swanwick 1994: 96). The model illustrates a dialectical relationship between musical experience ('intuition' in their terminology) and analysis. It suggests a continuous flow between the concrete and the abstract, with one building on the other, reminiscent of Maton's semantic wave.

[16]   Weekes' doctoral research comprises a parallel study of the New South Wales Music 1 and Business Studies Curricula. She investigates the impact of the curricular layout that uses bullet points for knowledge building (2014).

more abstract meanings, is a defining factor in educational success. Although the task of acquiring conceptual knowledge may seem like a straitjacket compared to the more embodied learning of playing and listening, it is not the process of conceptualisation itself that stultifies but the strong curricular boundaries that are maintained between playing and listening, and the theory of music. The integration of these is only possible if the empirical correlates with the abstract, and the concepts can be mapped onto the associated musical phenomena. The greater the fluency between these, the more students will acquire the tools to build principled knowledge structures that are the basis of cumulative knowledge building.

Although it presents a far more stratified, less 'progressive' curriculum design, the CAPS, like the Australian HSC curriculum, demands that students acquire the disciplinary language of music, comprising a considerable terminology. This is particularly clear in Topic 2, which is tellingly named 'Music Literacy'. Because Topic 2 presents shared content that all students will cover, those students will learn the terminology of WAM, along with the conceptualisation that follows its logic, even if their choice of stream is IAM. Here, Muller's description of grammaticality explains why this allocation of content is troublesome. Recall that strongly vertical conceptual structures with stable ordering principles that precisely match their corresponding empirical phenomena provide the possibility for explicit curricula. This matching is what is subverted in the South African curriculum because the superstructure of theoretical concepts presented in Topic 2 is not unequivocally connected to the other two topics outlining specific content for IAM. While there is certainly a degree of correlation, with particular theoretical concepts applying equally to African music, WAM and jazz (division of the beat presents a rudimentary example), the curriculum's orientation toward tonal-functional harmony means that much of the content of Topic 2 concerns keys and their relationships, and the concepts that underpin large scale, composed works based on linear harmony.

Viewed from the other direction, the terms found in the individualised African content enjoy no deeper theoretical expansion in Topic 2 (McConnachie 2016: 131). Here are some examples: All scales and modes outlined in the content are based on equal-temperament and there is no mention of alternative scales like those on the Xhosa *uhadi* and Zulu *umakhweyana* bows. These cannot be accurately produced on an equal-tempered instrument. A reading of the IAM Curriculum gives the impression that African compositional techniques begin and end with call and response techniques. Compositional techniques particular to African musicking, for example, the hocket structure of the single note pipe traditions such as the Venda *tshikona* and Pedi *dinaka*, are omitted. While significant theoretical concepts such as these seem to be absent from the Curriculum, individualised African terms that do occur in the IAM content are not reflected to any degree in the evaluation content. This somewhat disjointed curriculum is problematic because at its root, different types of knowledge have been put together through the curricularising process, but the potential relations between them are ruptured. Terms in one topic do not connect with those in another topic, and

so conceptual content maps poorly onto the empirical. The outcome of this disconnected curriculum can only be confusion, and the prevention of cumulative knowledge building, as the flow between concepts of weaker and stronger semantic gravity is interrupted.

In terms of conceptual content that can be curricularised, a central challenge in creating a curriculum from oral tradition is the relative absence of specialist vocabulary. The task of relocating knowledge from oral sites, in formal, stratified curricula demands, in addition to music, content in the form of language. This is not straightforward if the oral practice yields few terms, as is the case even with the more virtuosic African musical practices (Agawu 2016, Chernoff 1979, Dargie 1988, Nketia 1975). Agawu rigorously argues that creating special terms for African music, or rejecting the use of Western staff notation in transcriptions of African music, only serves to exoticise the music and thus to subordinate it (2003, 2016). He argues for the use of shared terms and insists that the commonalities between African and Western music should be emphasised. He asserts that using Western terms and theories to describe African knowledge is appropriate because "the truth is that no device or procedure found in African music is unheard of in Western music, especially if we consider the musical practices of Medieval Europe" (2016: 156).

Agawu's pragmatic approach serves as a starting point where Western musical terms apply equally well to matching concepts in African musical expression. Furthermore, the advantage of using Western musical theory in an African curriculum is that it has gained widespread currency in Africa, albeit through the colonising work of organisations such as the ABRSM. Certainly, there are many concepts that are shared by all music, but in the case of the South African curriculum, as has been outlined above, at a certain point the musics part ways. At this point the wholesale application of conventional Western theory of music courses in African syllabi will interrupt the potential for the integration of concrete and abstract meanings.

The relevance of Western terms for different African musical practices should be negotiated by stake holders of those practices. Where these are inadequate, concepts that are unique to certain practices need to be articulated along with the appropriate terminology. Where these concepts occur across many musical practices, agreement on common terms will be beneficial to the wider field. The ground has been laid in this endeavour in the body of research concerning African musics and it should continue with cooperation between practitioners and the researchers who work alongside them. Research in ethnomusicology and African music education indicates that the values of IAM do not always match those of WAM and this implies that the verticality of IAM knowledge is based on its own sets of distinctive criteria. The specialist knowledge of any IAM curriculum must be based on these criteria. The challenge of curriculum development is the recontextualization of practice-specific meanings to allow both concrete and abstract knowledge that presents the potential to be 'freed' from the context to allow learners the opportunity to apply their knowledge in new contexts.[17]

---

17 Recontextualisation is the term Bernstein uses for the process by which knowledge is delocated

Is this specialist knowledge?

Can the IAM Curriculum be said to present specialist knowledge? Bernstein states that to establish an individual identity, a field requires strong boundaries that differentiate it from other fields (1975: 81). Thus, its specialisation is displayed in its distinction from other fields. Bernstein also posits that progress within a horizontal knowledge structure such as music is achieved by the addition of a new 'language' within a field, incommensurate with those that have come before.

With respect to the South African Curriculum, we have seen that in the course of the curricularisation of IAM, the musical knowledge is incorporated into an existing curricular design. Following Bernstein, this incorporation diminishes the possibility for specialist knowledge that is established as a 'new language' different to previously existing ones, and that "offers the possibility of a fresh perspective, a new set of questions, a new set of connections and an apparently new problematic, and most importantly, a new set of speakers" (Bernstein 2000: 161).

The articulation of IAM in a separate stream implies that it is significantly different from WAM and Jazz, and the use of distinctive terms creates a sense of specialist knowledge. However, the specialist nature of the knowledge is not consistently nor coherently maintained throughout the curriculum. The substance of specialist terminology is not convincingly demonstrated through the curriculum documents and its connection to the theoretical concepts contained in Topic 2 is difficult to determine. A further contradiction lies in the assessment schedule, where the criteria conform to the priorities of WAM, subsuming the African content into Western conceptualisations of knowledge. Consequently, the content of the annual teaching plan is rendered ineffectual, and the knowledge devalued. The absence of specified IAM content in the assessment schedule suggests that this knowledge counts less than the Western musical knowledge that dominates. Furthermore, it prevents the possibility of the IAM stream establishing an individual or specialist identity.

A curriculum that incorporates African musical knowledge must show the unique quality of that knowledge and its subsequent capacity for cumulative knowledge building. The knowledge must be specialist, and it must incorporate meanings that afford the transfer between empirical and conceptual understandings. While a cursory reading of the IAM Curriculum might indicate individuality, specialist terminology and language is meaningless if it does not articulate a coherent curriculum that makes clear both theoretical and practical knowledge, and the connection between them. In Maton's terms, this requires meanings with various strengths of semantic gravity, and the curricular and pedagogical possibility of movement between these. Without the capacity for cumulative knowledge building, the justification for African music's place in the curriculum will always be in question.

If African musics are to be curricularised for school or university, a thorough understanding of their organising principles is an essential first step. Without this, as

---

from its original context and relocated in curriculum (Bernstein 1990: 184).

the example of the IAM CAPS illustrates, the temptation to fall back on the established formulas of Western music education will be hard to resist. This temptation, though it may make sense for particular aspects of a curriculum where there is a high degree of consonance between concepts, will result in the kind of disjointed and incoherent curriculum evidenced in the CAPS.

It is in this regard that academic journals such as *African Music* can make a significant contribution. Music curricula need both examples of performed music that will comprise their practical aspect, and a means of making explicit the conceptual structure on which their verticality rests. The scholarly contribution of this journal toward documenting African musical knowledge presents a rich resource for curriculum content. Such research could provide insight into musical performance, as well as the formal conceptualisation of supporting musical knowledge. Both are essential if the organising principles of the musical practice are to be coherently recontextualised in formal curricula.

Power struggles and decolonisation

Bernstein sees curriculum construction as "the site of pedagogic struggle between conservative and 'progressive' positions within recontextualizing fields" (1990: 213). The South African students calling for free education and a decolonized curriculum, and scholars debating what music should constitute the curriculum also see the curriculum as a site of struggle in which the hegemonic West wields ongoing power against subordinated knowledges. Yet because the specialist knowledge of education must equip learners with the tools for cumulative learning, any affirmation of indigenous African knowledge in the music curriculum must also provide access to cumulative knowledge building. This requires the ability to manipulate both empirical, practical knowledge and theoretical, conceptual knowledge, both of which can be freed from the particular, thus encapsulating the potential for context-independent knowledge. Without these, the decolonisation project will be meaningless.

References

Addo, Akosua Obuo, Florence Miya and Hetta Potgieter
2003   "Integrating the Arts." in *Musical Arts in Africa Theory: Practice and Education*, Anri Herbst, Meki Nzewi and Kofi Agawu, eds. Pretoria: UNISA.

Agawu, Kofi
2003   *Representing African Music: Postcolonial Notes, Queries, Positions*. New York: Routledge.
2016   *The African Imagination in Music*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Akuno, Emily Achieng'
2005   "To 'Sing the Lord's Song in a Strange Land': Music in the Education of the Kenyan Child." in *Emerging Solutions for Musical Arts Education in Africa*, Anri Herbst, ed. 54–63. Cape Town: African Minds.

Bantwini, Bongani D.
2010.   "How Teachers Perceive the New Curriculum Reform: Lessons
               from a School District in the Eastern Cape Province, South Africa."
               International Journal of Educational Development 30: 83–90.
Berliner, Paul
1978   *The Soul of Mbira: Music and Traditions of the Shona People of
               Zimbabwe*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
Bernstein, Basil
1975   *Class, Codes and Control (Vol. 3): Toward a Theory of Educational
               Transmissions.* London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
1990   *Class, codes and control (Vol. 4): The structuring of pedagogic discourse.*
               London: Routledge.
2000   *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique.*
               New York and Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield.
Bertram, Carol
2012   "Bernstein's Theory of the Pedagogic Device as a Frame to Study
               History Curriculum Reform in South Africa." *Yesterday and Today* 7:
               1–11.
Blacking, John
1976   *How Musical Is Man?* London: Faber and Faber.
Bolton, Heidi
2006   "Pedagogy, Subjectivity and Mapping Judgement in Art, a Weakly
               Structured Field of Knowledge." *Journal of Education* 40: 59–78.
Carroll, Christine
2017   "Playing the Field: An Australian Case Study of Student Popular
               Musicians' Informal Learning in Senior Secondary Classroom Music
               Education." PhD Dissertation: University of Sydney, Sydney.
Chadwick, Sheelagh
2012   "Teachers as Agents in Botswana's Music Education: Challenges and
               Possibilities." *Music Education Research* 14(4): 430–47.
Chanhunka, Robert A.
2005   "Music Education In Malawi: The Crisis And The Way Forward." PhD
               Dissertation: University of Pretoria, Pretoria.
Chernoff, John Miller
1979   *African Rhythm, African Sensibility: Aesthetics and Social Action in
               African Musical Idioms*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
Dargie, David
1988   *Xhosa Music: Its Techniques and Instruments with a Collection of Songs*.
               Cape Town: David Philip.
Delport, Alette, and Josphat Mufute
2010   "Training the Non-Specialist Music Teacher: Insights from a
               Zimbabwean Case Study." *Journal of the Musical Arts in Africa* 7(1): 1–15.

Department of Education
2011 *Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) Music*. Pretoria: Government printer.

Diop, Cheikh Anta
1996 *Towards the African Renaissance: Essays in African Culture and Development 1946 - 1960*. London: Karnak House.

Drummond, Urvi
2015 "Music education in South African schools after apartheid: teacher perceptions of Western and African Music." PhD Dissertation: University of Glasgow, Glasgow.

Elliot, David J.
1995 *Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Ensor, Paula
1997 "School Mathematics, Everyday Life and the NQF: A Case of Non-Equivalence?" *Pythagorus* 41: 36–44.

Ensor, Paula, and J Galant
2005 "Knowledge and Pedagogy: Sociological Research in Mathematics Education in South Africa." in *Researching Mathematics Education in South Africa. Perspectives, Practices and Possibilities*, R. Vithal, J. Adler and C. Keitel, eds. Pretoria: HSRC Press.

Gamble, Jeanne
2001 "Modelling the Invisible: The Pedagogy of Craft Apprenticeship." *Studies in Continuing Education* 23(2): 185–200.

Gatien, Greg
2009 "Categories and Music Transmission." *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 8(2): 94–119.

Green, Lucy
2001 *How Popular Musicians Learn: A way ahead for Music Education*. Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate.
2008 *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy*. Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate.

Hellberg, Elsabie
2014 "A Critical Review of South Africa's Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement Grades 10-12 Music." Masters dissertation: University of the Free State, Bloemfontein.

Herbst, Anri, Meki Nzewi and Kofi Agawu, eds.
2003 *Musical Arts in Africa: Theory, Practice and Education*. Pretoria, South Africa: UNISA.

Herbst, Anri, ed.
2005 *Emerging Solutions for Musical Arts Education in Africa.* Cape Town: African Minds.

Hoadley, Ursula
 1997   "An Analysis of the Constitution of a School Subject through
       Recontextualising; the Case of the NAC Drama Syllabus." Masters
       Dissertation: University of Cape Town, Cape Town.
 2005   "Social Class, Pedagogy and the Specialization of Voice in Four South
       African Primary Schools." PhD Dissertation: University of Cape Town,
       Cape Town.
 2011   "Knowledge, Knowers and Knowing: Curriculum Reform in South
       Africa." in *Curriculum in Today's World: Configuring Knowledge,*
       Identities, Work and Politics, Lyn Yates and M. Grumet, eds. 139–54.
       Abingdon: Routledge.
Irivwieri, Godwin Ogheneruemu
 2009   "The Implementation of the Creative Arts Curriculum in Secondary
       Schools in Nigeria." *African Research Review* 3(3): 342–58.
Jackson, Fiona
 2015   "Using Legitimation Code Theory to Track Pedagogic Practice in a
       South African English Home Language Poetry Lesson." *Journal of*
       Education 63.
Kwami, Robert
 1998   "Non-Western Musics in Education: Problems and Possibilities."
       British Journal of Music Education 15(2): 161–70.
Kwami, Robert, Eric Akrofi and S. Adams
 2003   "Integrating Musical Arts Cultures." in *Musical Arts in Africa Theory:*
       Practice and Education, Anri Herbst, Meki Nzewi and Kofi Agawu,
       eds. 261–78. Pretoria: UNISA.
Lamont, Alexandra, and Karl Maton
 2010   "Unpopular Music: Beliefs and Behaviours towards Music in
       Education." in *Sociology and Music Education*, Ruth Wright, ed. 63–80.
       Farnham: Ashgate.
Ligoya, Mildred Alinane
 2013   "An Exposition of Musical Arts Education in Malawi." Masters
       Dissertation: University of the Free State, Bloemfontein.
Luckett, Kathy, and Aditi Hunma
 2014   "Making Gazes Explicit: Facilitating Epistemic Access in the
       Humanities." *Higher Education* 67: 183–98.
Mans, Minette E.
 1997   "Namibian Music and Dance as Ngoma in Arts Education." PhD
       Dissertation: University of Natal, Durban.
Mapana, Kedmon
 2013   "Musical Traditions in the School Curriculum: Attitudes of Tanzanian
       Music Educators." PhD Dissertation: Seattle Pacific University, Seattle
       WA.

Martin, Jodie
   2012   "On Notes and Knowers: The Representation, Legitimation and Evaluation of Jazz." PhD Dissertation: University of Adelaide, Adelaide.

Maton, Karl
   2014   *Knowledge and Knowers: Towards a Realist Sociology of Education*. Abingdon: Routledge.

McConnachie, Boudina
   2016   "Indigenous and Traditional Musics in the School Classroom: A Re-Evaluation of the South African Indigenous African Music (IAM) Curriculum." PhD Dissertation: Rhodes University, Grahamstown.

McPhail, Graham J.
   2012   "The Canon or the Kids: Teachers and the Recontextualisation of Classical and Popular Music in the Secondary School Curriculum." PhD Dissertation: University of Auckland, Auckland.
   2013   "The Canon or the Kids: Teachers and the Recontextualisation of Classical and Popular Music in the Secondary School Curriculum." *Research Studies in Music Education* 35(1): 7–20.
   2014   "The Right to Enhancement: Students Talking about Music Knowledge in the Secondary School." *The Curriculum Journal* 25(3): 306–25.

Moore, Gwen
   2013   "Musical Value, Ideology and Unequal Opportunity: Backgrounds, Assumptions and Experiences of Students and Lecturers in Irish Higher Education." PhD Dissertation: University of London Institute of Education, London.

Muller, Johan
   2007   "On Splitting Hairs: Hierarchy, Knowledge and the School Curriculum." in *Language, Knowledge and Pedagogy*, Frances Christie and J. R. Martin, eds. 65–86. London: Continuum.

Mumpuka, Aloysio
   2009   "The Status of Music Education in the Selected High Schools in Lusaka Province, Zambia." Masters Dissertation: North-West University, Potchefstroom.

Musakula, Franklins Mwansa
   2014   "An Exploration into the Teaching of African Music in Two Primary Colleges of Education in Zambia." Masters Dissertation: Oslo and Akershus University College of Applied Sciences, Oslo.

Myers, L.Peta
   2016   "Knowledge Structures and Their Relevance for Teaching and Learning in Introductory Financial Accounting." *South African Journal of Accounting Research* 30(1): 79–95.

Nketia, J. H. Kwabena
    1975   *The Music of Africa*. London: Gollancz.
Ntsihlele, Flora
    1982   "Zulu Children's Songs." Honours Paper: University of Natal, Durban.
Nzewi, Meki
    2003   "Acquiring Knowledge of the Musical Arts in Traditional Society." in
                Musical Arts in Africa: Theory, Practice and Education, Anri Herbst,
                Meki Nzewi and Kofi Agawu, eds. Pretoria: UNISA.
    2005   *Learning the Musical Arts in Contemporary Africa: Derived by*
                Indigenous Knowledge Systems. Vol. I. CIIMDA.
Oehrle, Elizabeth
    2013   "The Talking Drum: Towards the Dissemination of Musics in South
                Africa." *Journal of the Musical Arts in Africa* 10(1): 135–38.
Philpott, Chris and Ruth Wright
    2012   "Teaching, Learning, and Curriculum Content." in *The Oxford*
                Handbook of Music, Gary McPherson and Graham Welch, eds.
                441–59. New York: Oxford University Press.
Sætre, Jon Helge
    2014   "Preparing Generalist Student Teachers to Teach Music: A Mixed-
                Methods Study of Teacher Educators and Educational Content in
                Generalist Teacher Education Music Courses." PhD Dissertation:
                Norwegian Academy of Music, Oslo.
Schudel, Ingrid
    2014   "Exploring a Knowledge-Focused Trajectory for Researching
                Environmental Learning in the South African Curriculum." *Southern*
                African Journal of Environmental Education 30: 96–117.
Shalem, Yael and Lynne Slonimsky
    2010   "Seeing Epistemic Order: Construction and Transmission of
                Evaluative Criteria." *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 31(6):
                755–78.
Siebörger, Ian and Ralph D. Adendorff
    2015   "Resemiotizing Concerns from Constituencies in the South African
                Parliament." *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*
                33(2): 171–97.
Small, Christopher
    1984   *Music of the Common Tongue: Survival and Celebration in Afro-American*
                Music. London: Calder.
South African Department of Basic Education
    2014a   "Music Examination Guidelines Grade 12." Department of Basic
                Education Republic of South Africa.
    2014b   "Music Guidelines for Practical Assessment Tasks." Department of
                Basic Education Republic of South Africa.

Swanwick, Keith
    1994   *Musical Knowledge: Intuition, Analysis, and Music Education.* London:
                Routledge.
Swanwick, Keith and Joyce Tillman
    1986   "The Sequence of Musical Development: A Study of Children's
                Composition." *British Journal of Music Education* 3(3): 305–39.
Weekes, Patricia
    2014   "From Dot Points to Disciplinarity: The Theory and Practice of
                Disciplinary Literacies in Secondary Schooling." PhD Dissertation:
                University of Sydney, Sydney.
Woodford, Paul
    2005   *Democracy and Music Education: Liberalism, Ethics, and the Politics of
                Practice*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
Wright, Ruth
    2008   "Kicking the Habitus: Power, Culture and Pedagogy in the Secondary
                School Music Curriculum." *Music Education Research* 10(3): 389–402.
Wright, Ruth and Brian Davies
    2010   "Class, Power, Culture and the Music Curriculum." in *Sociology and
                Music Education*, Ruth Wright, ed. 35–50. Farnham: Ashgate.
Wright, Ruth and Hildegard Froehlich
    2012   "Basil Bernstein's Theory of the Pedagogic Device and Formal Music
                Schooling: Putting the Theory into Practice." *Theory Into Practice*
                51(3): 212–20.

Personal communication with author
Khemese, Millicent. 3 February 2017.